

**Email chain: Frank Clemente**

**Date** 09/10/15 (16:27:44 UTC)  
**Fro** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)  
**m**  
**To** [XXXXXXXXXX](#)

Dear Professor Clemente,

I work for premiere consultancy firm Horizon Focus, an innovative company which specialises in helping businesses grow into international players, with a special focus on Asian markets.

We are currently working for a client with significant interests in the Indonesian energy sector, who is looking to safeguard their interests there.

Our client is keen to finance a short briefing paper by a well respected academic to counter damaging studies on Indonesian coal deaths, which have appeared in run up to Paris.

We hope this paper would put forward the benefits of increased coal production for Indonesian development.

I am writing now to see if this is something you would be interested in? Given your important work in this area and your position at Pennsylvania State University we believe a very short paper authored by yourself could work strongly in our client's favour.

If this is of interest perhaps we could discuss your rates and our proposed timeline?

Very best wishes,

Robin Simon

---

**Date** 11/10/15 (13:52:34 UTC)  
**Fro** [Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>](#)  
**m**  
**To** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)

Robin-- thank you for your note on the Indonesian energy sector. I will say at the outset that your group's decision to take a proactive role in countering anti-coal hyperbole is wise indeed. I often work with the U.S. National Coal Council and can attest that many coal based companies in this country sat passively by while relentless attacks on coal proceeded. The American coal industry has paid a heavy price for such complacency.

I have written, spoken and testified quite a bit on coal's importance to the quality of life around the world, especially in developing nations. I have worked with the Coal Industry Advisory Board, International Energy Agency, World Coal Association, the American Coal Council and the NCC, as well as a number of private coal based companies and regional groups.

Given this background I would be very interested in the project you described and would be glad to talk or interact by email. I am generally free this coming week at your convenience. This week I am at my Pennsylvania office and next week at my office in Florida.

Please let me know your preferences and thank you for your consideration—Frank

---

**Date** 13/10/15 (15:43:05 UTC)  
**Fro** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)  
**m**  
**To** [Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>](#)

Dear Professor Clemente,

Thank you so much for getting back to us so quickly. It is great to know you are interested in our project.

We have a meeting with our client later this week so perhaps we could arrange a time to talk this over next week when we have the most recently information about time-scale and ideal content? Would next Thursday work for you?

In the meantime, it would be really helpful to get your thoughts on the following:

- Would we be able to quote you as Professor Emeritus at Penn State University on the research paper?
- We are keen to get this research out far and wide and have ideas of media outlets that would be open to this in the UK, but would welcome any ideas of US outlets or contacts you may have. And on that, it would be useful to know, in your experience, whether you would need to declare the source funding when publishing research of this kind in the US?
- how do you usually invoice for projects such as these- do you have a day rate or do you charge by the project? (Once we have this we can take it to the client to get confirmation on amounts, etc.)

Thanks again for taking the time to consider this.

Very best wishes,

Robin

---

**Date** 13/10/15 (16:33:57 UTC)  
**Fro** [Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>](#)  
**m**  
**To** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)

Robin -- thank you for response. Looks like our emails crossed on the web. I can talk Thursday, October 22 any time after 9am New York time. I can send my contact numbers next week as not totally sure where I will be. In response to your questions:

1. I am a full member of the graduate faculty here at Penn State so quoting me as Professor Emeritus at the University poses no difficulty whatsoever.
2. I have a number of media contacts here in the United States that would likely be interested in such a report . I have little doubt we can publish the findings here in the US. There is no requirement to declare source funding in the US. My research and writing has been supported by government agencies, trade associations, the University and private companies and all has been published under the rubric of me as an independent scholar--

which I am.

3. I prefer to have a fixed-price contract for my research projects as that tends to minimize misunderstandings by both parties. When I do utilize an hourly rate it is at \$275/hr plus travel expenses. I do not charge overhead

I look forward to talking to you next Thursday and will wait until I hear from you as to the time. In the meanwhile, if there is any information you think might help me in conceptualizing the project please pass it along. Best regards –Frank

---

**Date** 15/10/15 (16:41:42 UTC)  
**Fro** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)  
**m**  
**To** Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>

Dear Frank,

Many thanks for all this information, it really is most helpful and allows us to lay out all the options clearly to the client.

As mentioned, we're due to discuss this all further with the client imminently, but I thought I'd take this opportunity to give you a bit more information.

We're hoping to produce a short, pithy research briefing of around 2,000 words. Something that can be easily quoted and digested by politicians and the public alike.

The main point of this paper is to counter damaging research on linking coal to premature deaths (in particular the WHO's figure that 3.7 million people die per year from fossil fuel pollution).

We're keen to find the strongest possible way to counter/bury this narrative in time for Paris. We'd love to get your thoughts on the best angles we could take to do this. (We do not think our report has to be completely specific to Indonesia, though that is the country of interest to our client.)

In terms of timeline, once we get the greenlight light from the client we'd be looking to produce something by 20 November, to give us time to run the copy by the company for their edits and approval.

We're exploring a few options on behalf of our client and in order to facilitate their decision making we'd like to be able to provide examples of work from the various people we are talking to. So if you were able to supply anything similar you've produced in the past, with an idea of what you charged as a total project price, that would be most helpful.

We think we're well on the way to moving things forward on this, and we're all very grateful for your help thus far.

Best wishes,

Robin

---

**Date** 16/10/15 (14:27:19 UTC)  
**From** Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>  
**To** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)  
**Attachments** global\_value\_of\_coal.pdf 5.3 MB  
s

Robin --was traveling off grid so sorry no response earlier. Attached is my Global Value of Coal paper I did for International Energy Agency. I wrote just about every word in the paper. The project you described is in my skill set and I estimate cost at \$15,000 USD. Best regards --Frank

---

**Date** 21/10/15 (16:00:30 UTC)  
**Fro** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)  
**m**  
**To** Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>

Dear Frank,

Just a quick note to say thanks for sending over that paper- it looks very interesting indeed.

Our client is busy weighing up options and we hope to have more for you soon.

Thanks, Robin

---

**Date** 03/11/15 (13:44:20 UTC)  
**Fro** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)  
**m**  
**To** Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>

Dear Frank,

Many apologies for the slow response. Our client is weighing up options and strategy ideas, but everything you have provided so far has been most helpful for that.

Can I just check, you sent over that impressive Global Value of Coal paper- did you mean that cost \$15,000? I just ask because it is longer than the briefing we have planned. It would be good to know if this was the price for this paper, or how much a paper of this length would cost.

Thanks,

Robin

---

**Date** 04/11/15 (16:19:02 UTC)  
**Fro** Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>  
**m**  
**To** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)

Robin--hope all is well. No problem on delay as I have been extremely busy. Not sure what you and our client have in mind but I was thinking an 8-10 page paper when I mentioned the \$15,000. My op/ed fee usually is \$6000 for 2-3 pages. The Global Value of Coal was more extensive and the cost there was \$50,000 for about an 8 week effort. Whatever is done my goal would be to get the results published in several venues. This is a crucial issue for hundreds of millions. They need coal from Indonesia. Frank

---

**Date** 12/11/15 (14:43:18 UTC)  
**Fro** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)  
**m**  
**To** [Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>](#)

Dear Frank,

Thanks for your patience and for sending through those extra details. It's great to know your op-ed fee as that is something we'd love to explore too- were there any op-eds as part of the Global Value of Coal package? We'd love to get an idea of where these could be placed.

I also noticed in your excellent Global Value of Coal report there is mention that the paper was sponsored by Peabody. As mentioned previously we are keen to put our work out without reference to our client- would you have any other examples of sponsored work where funders weren't disclosed in this way- just to reassure the client that it can be done?

Our timeline is now looking like end of March/ early April for the final output, which gives us more times to finalise our terms of reference and get plans in place. Again, sorry things are slower than we would have hoped but we're keen to make this as powerful an output as possible.

Thanks,

Robin

---

**Date** 25/11/15 (15:31:04 UTC)  
**From** [Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>](#)  
**To** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)  
**Attachments** Clemente op-ed.docx 17 KB

**Robin-- here is an op-ed I did on coal divestment. Picked up by over 50 newspapers in US. This one best online view:**

[http://www.gazettextra.com/20150319/con\\_protesters\\_oppose\\_energies\\_that\\_make\\_life\\_cleaner\\_and\\_better\\_for\\_all](http://www.gazettextra.com/20150319/con_protesters_oppose_energies_that_make_life_cleaner_and_better_for_all) //

**MARCH 19 — FRESNO BEE (104,991) //** Op-Ed "Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all" by Frank Clemente // <http://www.fresnobee.com/2015/03/19/4434970/protesters-cynically-oppose-energies.html>

**MARCH 23 — PRESS OF ATLANTIC CITY (68,477) //** Op-Ed "In praise of coal — yes coal" by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 23— KILLEEN (TX) DAILY HERALD (15,826) //** Op-Ed "Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all" by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 23 — BRYAN (TX) EAGLE (16,886) //** Op-Ed "Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all" by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — SALT LAKE CITY SUNDAY DESERET NEWS (160,617) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — HENDERSONVILLE (NC) SUNDAY TIMES NEWS (20,341) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — SPARTANBURG (SC) SUNDAY JOURNAL-HERALD (51,412) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — LANSING (MI) SUNDAY STATE JOURNAL (52,398) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — MISSOULA (MT) SUNDAY MISSOULIAN (34,546) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — MEDFORD (OR) SUNDAY MAIL TRIBUNE (22,292) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — LAWTON (OK) SUNDAY CONSTITUTION (24,755) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — REDDING (CA) SUNDAY RECORD SEARCHLIGHT (20,271) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — WILLIMANTIC (CT) SUNDAY CHRONICLE (6,452) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — FAIRMONT (WV) SUNDAY TIMES WEST VIRGINIAN (10,690) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 22 — ALLENTOWN (PA) SUNDAY MORNING CALL (127,517) // Op-Ed**  
“Fossil-free protesters oppose energies that improve our lives” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 21 — BURLINGTON (IA) HAWKEYE (15,943) // Op-Ed** “Students cynically oppose energies that make life better” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 21 — SALINAS CALIFORNIAN (9,355) // Op-Ed** “Asking schools to dump fossil fuel stocks is misguided” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 20 — SHERMAN (TX) HERALD-DEMOCRAT (20,287) //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente // <http://heralddemocrat.com/opinion/national-commentary/con-protesters-cynically-oppose-energies-make-life-cleaner-and-better>

**MARCH 20 — NEW BEDFORD (MA) STANDARD-TIMES (21,582) //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente // <http://www.southcoasttoday.com/article/20150320/OPINION/150329937/101094>

**MARCH 19 — HAMODIA.COM / BROOKLYN, NY / THE NEWSPAPER OF TORAH JEWRY //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 19 — CANADA FREE PRESS / TORONTO / CANADA'S MOST VIEWED POLITICAL WEB SITE //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente

**MARCH 19 — JANESVILLE (WI) GAZETTE (17,834) //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente // [http://www.gazettextra.com/20150319/con\\_protesters\\_oppose\\_energies\\_that\\_make\\_life\\_cleaner\\_and\\_better\\_for\\_all](http://www.gazettextra.com/20150319/con_protesters_oppose_energies_that_make_life_cleaner_and_better_for_all) //

**MARCH 19 — WCLO AM/FM / BELOIT-JANESVILLE, WI //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente // [http://www.gazettextra.com/20150319/con\\_protesters\\_oppose\\_energies\\_that\\_make\\_life\\_cleaner\\_and\\_better\\_for\\_all](http://www.gazettextra.com/20150319/con_protesters_oppose_energies_that_make_life_cleaner_and_better_for_all) //

**MARCH 12 — WCLO AM/FM / BELOIT-JANESVILLE, WI //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente // [http://www.gazettextra.com/20150319/con\\_protesters\\_oppose\\_energies\\_hat\\_make\\_life\\_cleaner\\_and\\_better\\_for\\_all](http://www.gazettextra.com/20150319/con_protesters_oppose_energies_hat_make_life_cleaner_and_better_for_all) //

**MARCH 19 — BELLINGHAM (WA) HERALD (23,658) //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente // <http://www.bellinghamherald.com/2015/03/19/4194172/protesters-cynically-oppose-energies.html>

**MARCH 19 — BRADENTON (FL) HERALD (45,925) //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente // <http://www.bradenton.com/2015/03/19/5699661/protesters-cynically-oppose-energies.html>

**MARCH 19 — HILTON HEAD (SC) ISLAND PACKET (19,960) //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente // <http://www.islandpacket.com/2015/03/19/3654102/protesters-cynically-oppose-energies.html>

**MARCH 19 — BEAUFORT (SC) GAZETTE (9,961) //** Op-Ed “Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente // <http://www.islandpacket.com/2015/03/19/3654102/protesters-cynically-oppose-energies.html>

**MARCH 19 — CARROLL COUNTY TIMES / WESTMINSTER, MD (24,194) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by  
Frank Clemente // <http://www.carrollcountytimes.com/search/sns-tns-bc-fossildivestment-con-20150319,0,1675328.story>

**MARCH 19 — HANOVER (PA) EVENING SUN (18,380) // Op-Ed** “Protesters  
cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank  
Clemente //

**MARCH 19 — ARCAMAX.COM // ARCAMAX PUBLISHING // Op-Ed** “Protesters  
cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank  
Clemente //

**MARCH 19 — TRIBUNE NEWS SERVICE.COM // Op-Ed** “Protesters cynically  
oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by Frank Clemente //

**MARCH 23 — HONOLULU (HAWAII) STAR-ADVERTISER (196,020) // Op-Ed**  
“Protesters cynically oppose energies that make life cleaner and better for all” by  
Frank Clemente

---

**Date** 25/11/15 (15:45:52 UTC)  
**From** Frank Clemente <XXXXXXXXXX>  
**To** [robin.simon@horizonfocus.com](mailto:robin.simon@horizonfocus.com)  
**Attachment** Clemente TVA comments.pptx 1.4 MB  
**s**

Robin -- here is my testimony on the Tennessee Valley Authority decision to close coal plants. Note that in none of these cases is the sponsor identified. All my work is published as an independent scholar-- Frank